M 4-27-95



# United States Department of the Interior

# BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT WINNEMUCCA DISTRICT OFFICE

705 East 4th Street Winnemucca, Nevada 89445

APR 2 7 1995

4130 (NV-024.14)

Dear Interested Party:

A Final Full Force and Effect Multiple Use Decision (FMUD) for the Paiute Meadows Allotment was issued on April 12, 1993. This FMUD was appealed by Nevada Division of Wildlife (NDOW), The Commission for the Preservation of Wild Horses and Burros (CPWHB), Wild Horse Organized Assistance (WHOA), William Cummings, and Daniel Russell. Irvin E. and Sandy Brown filed a motion in which they sought to substitute themselves as the "real party in interest."

William Cummings and Daniel Russell withdrew their appeals, and Irvin E. and Sandy Brown withdrew their motion to be substituted as the real party in interest. NDOW, CPWHB, and WHOA have entered into a stipulated agreement with the Bureau of Land Management to withdraw their appeals.

Therefore, the enclosed court orders for the dismissal of the appeals for NDOW, CPWHB, WHOA, William Cummings, Daniel Russell, and Irvin E. and Sandy Brown were issued.

Should you have any questions or comments please respond in writing to the attention of Mandy McCutcheon at the above address.

Sincerely yours,

Area Manager

Paradise-Denio Resource Area

Enclosure:

Court Order (April 7, 1995) Court Order (April 14, 1995) Stipulated Agreement



## United States Department of the Interior

#### OFFICE OF HEARINGS AND APPEALS

Hearings Division 6432 Federal Building Salt Lake City, Utah 84138 (Phone: 801-524-5344)

April 14, 1995



#### **ORDER**

WILLIAM C. CUMMINGS and DANIEL H. RUSSELL,

N2-93-8, IBLA 93-481

Appellants

v.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent

#### Appeals Dismissed

Based on filings with this office to the effect that appellants hereinabove have no further interest in these matters; and that Irvin E. and Sandy Brown, asserted successors in interest to said appellants, withdraw their motion that they be substituted as real parties in interest, these appeals are **dismissed**. Accordingly, the hearings in these matters set to commence April 17, 1995, in Reno, Nevada, are vacated.

Administrative Law Judge

Distribution

By Certified Mail:

Richard P. Bernstein, Esq. Brodovsky and Brodovsky 800 Cal Center Drive, Suite 300 Sacramento, California 95826-3225 (attorney for appellant Cummings)

Thomas S. Van Horne, Esq. 2991-B Gold Canal Drive Rancho Cordova, California 95670 (attorney for appellant Russell)

Irvin E. and Sandy Brown P.O. Box 478 Winnemucca, Nevada 89446

John R. Payne, Esq.
Assistant Regional Solicitor
U.S. Department of the Interior
2800 Cottage Way, Room E-2753
Sacramento, California 95825-1980
(attorney for respondent)

### By Regular Mail:

William C. Cummings 7700 College Town Dr., Suite 208 Sacramento, California 95826

Daniel H. Russell P.O. Box 339 Folsom, California 95670

Dawn Y. Lappin, Director Wild Horse Organized Assistance P.O. Box 555 Reno, Nevada 89504 C. Wayne Howle Deputy Attorney General State of Nevada 198 South Carson Street Carson City, Nevada 89710

State Director Bureau of Land Management 850 Harvard Way P.O. Box 12000 Reno, Nevada 89520-0006

Area Manager Paradise-Denic Resource Area Bureau of Land Management 705 East 4th Street Winnemucca, Nevada 89445



# United States Department of the Interior

# RECEIVED

#### OFFICE OF HEARINGS AND APPEALS

APR 11 1995

Hearings Division 6432 Federal Building Salt Lake City, Utah 84138 (Phone: 801-524-5344)

OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

April 7, 1995

#### **ORDER**

WILLIAM C. CUMMINGS and DANIEL H. RUSSELL,	: N2-93-8, IBLA 93-481
Appellant	
v.	
BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,	
Respondent	
NEVADA DIVISION OF WILDLIFE,	: N2-93-9, IBLA 93-482
Appellant	
v.	
BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,	
Respondent	
COMMISSION FOR THE PRESERVATION OF WILD HORSES,	: N2-93-10, IBLA 93-484
Appellant	
v.	
BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,	
Respondent	

WILD HORSE ORGANIZED ASSISTANCE,

N2-93-11, IBLA 93-483

Appellant

V.

:

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent

<u>Certain Appeals Dismissed</u>

<u>Motion to Continue (regarding remaining appeals) Denied</u>

<u>Other Rulings as Specified</u>

The captioned cases have been duly set for hearing to commence April 17, 1995, in Reno, Nevada.

On March 10, 1995, Irvin E. and Sandy Brown, asserted successors in interest to William C. Cummings and Daniel H. Russell, in a document modifying the caption hereinabove, but obviously pertinent to at least some of such matters, moved "for substitution," "to consolidate" and "to continue."

On March 27, 1995, respondent filed a "notice of appearance," "opposition" to the aforesaid motions, and a "motion to dismiss" the appeals of Cummings and Russell.

On March 31, 1995, appellants in N2-93-10 and IBLA 93-484, N2-93-09 and IBLA 93-482, and N2-93-11 and IBLA 93-483, and respondent, filed a document wherein the appeals in those matters are withdrawn.

On April 4, 1995, the Browns filed a reply to respondent's "opposition" and "motion to dismiss" (filed March 27 as noted above).

The rulings concerning these several documents are as follows:

1. The appeals in N2-93-10 and IBLA 93-484, N2-93-09 and IBLA 93-482, and N2-93-11 and IBLA 93-483 are **dismissed**. While the document filed March 31 states the withdrawal of the appeals to be subject to a stipulation set out thereinafter, it is my opinion I should not condition this dismissal on performance of the stipulation. If performance is assertedly not made with the stipulation, the parties may seek relief through other recourse.

- 2. Concerning the motions and oppositions (the filings of March 10 and 27, and April 4; for reasons set out in the documents and adopted herein as are apropos to the rulings:
  - (a) The issues in the appeals of Cummings and Russell (N2-93-8 and IBLA 93-481) remain justiciable and respondent's motion to dismiss is **denied**.
  - (b) No sufficient reason is given to consolidate an appeal assertedly made from a February 6, 1995, decision with the hearing of N2-93-8 and IBLA 93-481; accordingly the Browns' motion for such consolidation is **denied**.
  - (c) The motion to substitute the Browns as real parties in interest vice Cummings and Russell is **taken under advisement** and motion in this regard may be reasserted at the beginning of the hearing for further consideration at that time.
  - (d) Good cause and proper diligence are not found to justify a postponement of the hearing. The motion to continue is accordingly **denied**.

Therefore the hearing involving N2-93-8 and IBLA 93-481 will commence at 1:30 p.m. on April 17, 1995, in Room 5011, U.S. District Court, 300 Booth Street, Reno, Nevada, and will proceed thereat to conclusion. It seems that in fairness the appellants in N2-93-8 and IBLA 93-481, and the Browns, should have a copy of the document filed March 31, 1995 (containing the withdrawal of appeals of the other appellants, and the stipulation) and a copy is hereby provided those persons.

Administrative Law Judge

Distribution
By Certified Mail:

William C. Cummings 7700 College Town Dr., Suite 208 Sacramento, California 95826 (w/copy March 31 document)

Daniel H. Russell P.O. Box 339 Folsom, California 95670 (w/copy March 31 document)

Irvin E. and Sandy Brown
P.O. Box 478
Winnemucca, Nevada 89446
(w/copy March 31 document)

Dawn Y. Lappin, Director Wild Horse Organized Assistance P.O. Box 555 Reno, Nevada 89504

C. Wayne Howle Deputy Attorney General State of Nevada 198 South Carson Street Carson City, Nevada 89710

John R. Payne Assistant Regional Solicitor U.S. Department of the Interior 2800 Cottage Way, Room E-2753 Sacramento, California 95825-1980

Richard P. Bernstein, Esq. Brodovsky and Brodovsky 800 Cal Center Drive, Suite 300 Sacramento, California 95826-3225

Thomas S. Van Horne, Esq. 2991-B Gold Canal Drive Rancho Cordova, California 95670

### By Regular Mail:

State Director Bureau of Land Management 850 Harvard Way P.O. Box 12000 Reno, Nevada 89520-0006

Area Manager Paradise-Denio Resource Area Bureau of Land Management 705 East 4th Street Winnemucca, Nevada 89445 Wayne Klawell (sie 7) K

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR OFFICE OF HEARINGS AND APPEALS HEARINGS DIVISION

IRV & SANDY BROWN, successor in interest to William C. Cummings and Daniel Russell

Apellant,

VS.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent.

NEVADA DIVISION OF WILDLIFE,

Apellant,

Vô.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent.

THE COMM. FOR THE PRESERVATION OF WILD HORSES AND BURROS,

Apellant,

VS.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent.

No. N2-93-08

Appeal from the Area Manager's Final Decision dated April 12, 1993, Paradisc-Denio Resource Area, Winnemucca Dist, Nevada

No. N2-93-09

Appeal from the Area Manager's Final Decision dated April 12, 1993, Paradise-Denio Resource Area, Winnemucca Dist, Nevada

No. N2-93-10

Appeal from the Area Manager's Final Decision dated April 12, 1993, Paradise-Denio Resource Area, Winnemucca Dist, Nevada

# WILD HORSE ORGANIZED ASSISTANCE,

Apellant,

VS.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent.

IRV & SANDY BROWN,

Appellant,

VŠ.

BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT,

Respondent.

No. N2-93-10

Appeal from the Area Manager's Final Decision dated April 12, 1993, Paradise-Denio Resource Area, Winnemucca Dist, Nevada

No. N2-95-?

Appeal from the Area Manager's Decision dated Feb 6, 1995, Paradise-Denio Resource Area, Winnemucca Dist., Nevada

Irv and Sandy Brown's reply to Respondents Opposition to Motions from the Browns and Respondents Motion to Dismiss the Appeal of William Cummings.

### RESPONDENTS OPPOSITION TO MOTION FOR SUBSTITUTION

The BLM claims in their argument that I site no authority for my motion of substitution for William Cummings and Dan Russell. However, substitution of the real party in interest is a common law principle and acknowledged by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The concept is also expressed in 43 CFR 4.401(b) where the regulation confirms that a transferee must be made a party to any proceedings thereafter initiated adverse to the entry. The BLM admits that I am the real party in interest, therefore my substitution is appropriate.

# BLM OPPOSITION TO CONSOLIDATE THE FEB 6, 1995 APPEAL OF THE GRAZING PERMIT WITH THE 1993 FULL FORCE DECISION

The BLM contends that the Feb 6, 1995 is only a proposed decision and not a final decision. It is my understanding that one has 30 days after the issuance of a proposed decision to file a protest and if no protests are filed it automatically becomes final. Therefore my appeal which was filed on the 30th day should properly be considered an appeal rather than a protest and therefore should be consolidated with the 1993 appeal.

## BLM MOTION TO DISMISS THE APPEAL OF WILLIAM CUMMINGS

Contrary to the BLM's position, William Cummings continues to have an interest because he holds a mortgage on the Paiute Meadows Ranch. Should I default on that mortgage, the ownership of the ranch could revert to Mr. Cummings.

## **BLM OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO CONTINUE**

Since the other Appellants are withdrawing their appeals, an opportunity now exists wherein the local BLM authority and myself might use the extra time granted by continuance to negotiate a compromise favorable to both sides without resorting to the court.

Respectfully submitted this 3rd day of April, 1995.

Irvin E. Brown

P.O. Box 478

Winnemucca, NV 89446

#### CERTIFICATE OF FILING & SERVICE: 43 CFR 4.401

I certify that on this date, I transmitted the foregoing document to the office in which filing is required before the end of the period in which it was required to be filed, and I did so by depositing with the United States Postal Service, at Rancho Cordova, California an envelope containing the original said document, with postage for first class mail addressed to said office, as follows:

Office of Hearings & Appeaals Hearings Division 6432 Federal Building Salt Lake City, Utah 84138

and I did so by depositing with the United States Postal Service at Rancho Cordova, California an envelope containing a copy of said document, with postage for first class mail addressed to said office, as follows:

William Molini Director, NDOW P.O. Box 10678 Reno, NV 89520-0022

WHOA P.O. Box 555 Reno, NV 89504

Comm. for the Pre. of Wild Horses Stewart Facility Capitol Complex Carson City, NV 89710

USDI - Office of the Regional Solicitor 2800 Cottage Way, Room E-2753 Sacramento, CA 95825-1890

Dated this 3rd day of April, 1995.

IRVINE BROWN