

MODOC/WASHOE EXPERIMENTAL STEWARDSHIP PROGRAM

High Rock/Massacre Mountain TRT Meeting  
2/24/83

On February 24, 1983 the High Rock/Massacre Mountain TRT met to resolve the stocking rate issue (who shall take the reduction?) and to develop an interim grazing management system.

Those present were:

TRT Members: Rose Strickland, Dawn Lappin, Cecil Pierce, Ben Collins, Larry Hill (rep. Ken Earp), Garth Portillo (for Francis Riddell), Mike Del Grosso, Bob Bunyard, Ernest Eaton, Jim Jeffress and Donnel (Mick) Richards (rep. (Mrs. Ken Earp)

Absent TRT Members: Lee Chauvet and Francis Riddell .

Others: Rick Cooper, Bill Phillips, A.J. Johnson, Lee Delaney, Richard Westman, Roger Farschon (BLM Staff), Jim Cockrell (Ken Earp) and Jerry Hillyard.

Ben Collins opened the meeting with a reiteration of the success enjoyed by the Team to date.

Lee Delaney outlined the goals of the meeting:

- 1. Develop an interim grazing management system.
- 2. Obtain agreement on a stocking rate if possible (the basic question being who should take the reduction?).

Lee informed the group of the progress to date pursuant to the recommendations submitted in June, 1982. BLM has:

- 1. Developed a draft Cultural Resource Management Plan - out for review.
- 2. Started planning for a Habitat Management Plan - completion scheduled for FY'84.
- 3. Delineated a proposed Area of Critical Environmental Concern for the High Rock Canyon Complex.
- 4. Developed a proposed fenceline on westside of High Rock Canyon.
- 5. Presented stocking rate issue to Steering Committee and Executive Committee.
- 6. Met several times with livestock operators on stocking rate issue.
- 7. Expanded the range survey west of High Rock.

Jim Cockrell and Bob Bunyard then explained their livestock operations in the Massacre Mountain/High Rock area. Jim estimated a maximum of 200 cattle used the canyon in August and September. A.J. Johnson estimated utilization was 40-45% in the canyons for 1982. Bob stated he will run sheep in the Allotment this spring but intends to be out of the sheep business by fall. It was requested that the BLM present the carrying capacity data determined for the area west of High Rock Canyon. Bill Phillips presented the data along with a review of the 1963 range survey and other proposals as follows:

1963 - projected 18 SA/AUM carrying capacity (7,108 AUMs)

1981 - projected 11 SA/AUM carrying capacity (5,942 AUMs) in north portion of Massacre Mountain Allotment.

1982 - Expanded 1981 survey west of High Rock

- Projected 12.2 SA/AUM carrying capacity for Massacre Mountain (6,737 AUMs)
- Projected 30.1 SA/AUM carrying capacity for Little High Rock (959 AUMs)
- Projected 14.4 SA/AUM carrying capacity overall (7,696 AUMs Massacre Mountain and Little High Rock Allotments combined)

Bunyard Proposal (Individual Allotments)

- Bunyard area of use - 1981 survey projects 8.8 SA/AUM. This would provide 2,582 AUMs. Bunyard's active preference is 2,254 AUMs.
- Earps area of use - 1982 expanded survey projects 14.4 SA/AUM. This would provide 5,377 AUMs. Earp's active preference is 8,283.

BLM Proposal (Common Allotment)

- License Bunyard for 2,254 AUMs (current active preference)
- License Earp for 6,243 AUMs (Earp's proportionate share after reduction)
- Total 8,497 AUMs which would require 13.1 SA/AUM. 1982 expanded survey projects 14.4 SA/AUM carrying capacity (7,696 AUMs)

Other proposals were:

Rose Strickland Proposal (Common Allotment)

- License Bunyard for 2,254 AUMs (100% of active preference)
- License Earp for 5,746 AUMs (100% of reduction, 69% of active preference)
- Initial increases (up to 8,283 AUMs) would go to Earp when available.

Transfer - Lease (Common Allotment)

- AUMs would be exchanged between Earp and Bunyard either through a lease or transfer so as to maintain Bunyard's current active preference.

Interim grazing system (Common Allotment)

- This would provide livestock grazing in the canyon bottoms and east on a restrictive basis until prescriptive grazing is implemented.

Reductions based on proportionate shares (Common Allotment)

- Bunyard - 1,757 AUMs (22% reduction)
- Earp - 6,243 AUMs (25% reduction overall, includes 35% reduction in Little High Rock Allotment and 22% reduction in Massacre Mountain Allotment).

Lengthly discussions ensued on the proposals. Larry Hill said Earp will take his proportionate share of a reduction if Bunyard took his. Hill rejected any proposal in which Earp took all of the reduction or his proportionate share if Bunyard didn't take his proportionate share. Hill also rejected Bunyard's proposal for individual allotments until water, seedings and fences were on the ground and could be evaluated. Bob Bunyard said he would appeal any decision which contained a reduction or didn't designate individual allotments. Rose Strickland had major problems with an interim grazing system which had the main purpose of allowing grazing in the canyons and east of High Rock Canyon to offset reductions.

At this point it appeared an impasse was developing on both the stocking rate and interim grazing system. Ben Collins then briefed the group on issuing a decision based either on an agreement by the group or on BLM policy if an agreement was not reached. Basically Ben said an agreement would result in things happening on the ground within a short time period. However, a decision issued otherwise, can be appealed, takes five years to monitor and five years to adjust thereby creating a situation where things may not happen on the ground for a long time.

At this point the group broke for lunch at 12:30 PM.

The meeting reconvened at 1:45 PM. At this point, Lee Delaney rededicated the group and BLM to meeting the goals of the June, 1982 agreement. Lee also graphically illustrated the effects of a decision not based on an agreement:

- Monitor for five years
  - Issue two year notice
  - Five year adjustment
- } overlapping time periods } 10 years +
- If appealed:
    - Status quo
      - no reductions until appeal settled (normally takes 1-2 years)
      - no livestock conversion until appeal settled.

More discussion ensued, but little progress was made. All parties stuck by their earlier statements. At this point, an impasse was clearly developing. Ben Collins then polled the group as to their preferences for resolving the issues - decision based on BLM policy or decision based on an agreement. Everyone's preference was by agreement.

Bob Bunyard broke the impasse on the individual allotment issue by agreeing to drop his demand if the feasibility of an individual allotment would be studied over the next five years. Everyone agreed to this. Ben Collins emphasized that there was no guarantee of an individual allotment at the end of the five years but that we would study it.

Jim Cockrell then broke the impasse on the stocking rate issue. He stated that a reduction is needed, especially when Bob Bunyard converts his sheep to cattle. To help Bob, he offered to reduce his herd to 1000 head beginning in 1984. He stated there were other allotments that he could get if given time. 1000 head of cattle for six months requires 6000 AUMs. This left 243 AUMs of nonuse which Jim said Bob could use contingent upon Earps' approval. Both Larry Hill and Donnel (Mick) Richards felt they could get Ken and Doris Earp to agree to this and they also felt they could get agreement to start at the 6,243 AUM level if Bob started at 1,757 AUMs. At first, Bob rejected the idea, but then he agreed to the 22% reduction after reconsideration. The Team then agreed that an agreement should be drawn up reflecting Jim's proposal for Cockrell's, Bunyard's, Earps' and BLM's signatures. Jim emphasized the agreement could only be good if Earps concurred and for the length of his lease with Earps. It was also agreed that should Cockrell, Bunyard, Earps, and the BLM not reach an agreement, the BLM should move to reach the goals of the June, 1982 TRT agreement by issuing a formal decision on stocking rate, etc.

Two alternatives were proposed for reducing to the 8,000 AUM stocking level:

1) Drop to the 8,000 AUM figure in 1984

- Earp -	6,243 <sup>1/</sup> AUMs
- Bunyard -	<u>1,757</u> AUMs
Total	8,000 AUMs

1/ Bunyard would use 243 AUMs under an agreement with Earp's and Cockrell.

2) Equal successive increments beginning in 1984

<u>Permittee</u>	<u>Active Preference</u>
Bunyard	
1984 (-4.4%)	2,155 AUMs
1985 (-4.4%)	2,056 AUMs
1986 (-4.4%)	1,957 AUMs
1987 (-4.4%)	1,858 AUMs
<u>1988 (-4.4%)</u>	<u>1,757 AUMs</u>
Total (-22.0%)	1,757 AUMs

<u>Permittee</u>	<u>Active Preference</u>
Earp	
1984 (-5%)	7,875 AUMs
1985 (-5%)	7,467 AUMs
1986 (-5%)	7,059 AUMs
1987 (-5%)	6,651 AUMs
<u>1988 (-5%)</u>	<u>6,243 AUMs</u>
Total (-25%)	6,243 AUMs

In summary, the following agreements were reached and supported by the Team:

1. Bob Bunyard agreed to drop the demand for individual allotments if the feasibility would be studied over the next five years.
2. Bob Bunyard agreed to the proposal 22% reduction. (Hill had committed Earp to accepting proportionate share of the reduction during June, 1982 TRT meeting.)
3. Contingent upon the Earps approval and for the life of the Base Property lease, Jim Cockrell will license 243 AUMs as nonuse. Bob Bunyard then may use the 243 AUMs as temporary nonrenewable. An agreement will be drawn up reflecting this if the Earps concur.
4. The Team will support the Earps' choice of which alternative to use in reducing to 8,000 AUMs (either reduce to 8,000 AUMs in 1984 or reduce to 8,000 AUMs in five incremental steps beginning in 1984). Hill and Richards will present these alternatives to the Earps and then get back to the BLM to incorporate into the agreement noted in #3.
5. The Team agreed that if an agreement is not reached, the BLM should move to reach the goals of the June, 1982 TRT agreement by issuing a formal decision.
6. Rather than try to develop an interim grazing system, the Team agreed to prioritize the following with the thought that the AMP, CRMP, HMP, HMAP, and RMP contain the specifics.

- Priority

1. Develop water
2. Burn in the Dogleg
3. Seed in the Dogleg
- 3a. Wild Horse Management
4. Fence west of High Rock Canyon
- 1-4. Study feasibility of individual allotments (equal in priority to all above).

2/24/83 Hi Rock/ Mass mtn.  
TRT meeting

Rose Strickland  
Dawn G. Lappin  
Cecil Pierce  
Ben F. Collins  
Larry E. Hill  
Garth Portillo  
Mike Del Russo  
Bob Brieryard  
Dannell Richards  
Ernest G. Eaton  
James Cockell  
Jenny Hillgard  
Bill Phillipps  
Roger Farschon  
Jim Jones  
Bob Delaney